

*****DRAFT MINUTES*****

Alexandria Board of Architectural Review
Old & Historic Alexandria District

Wednesday, June 6, 2012
7:30pm, City Council Chambers, City Hall
301 King Street, Alexandria, Virginia 22314

Members Present: Tom Hulfish, Chairman
Oscar Fitzgerald
Wayne Neale
John von Senden
Peter Smeallie

Members Absent: Chip Carlin
Art Keleher

Staff Present: Planning & Zoning
Michele Oaks, Historic Preservation Planner
Al Cox, FAIA, Historic Preservation Manager

The meeting was called to order at 7:35 p.m. by Chairman Hulfish.

I. MINUTES

1. Consideration of the minutes of the public hearing of May 16, 2012.
BOARD ACTION: Approved as submitted, 5-0.

On a motion by Dr. Fitzgerald, seconded by Mr. von Senden, the minutes were approved, as submitted, 5-0.

II. CONSENT ITEMS

Items on the Consent Calendar are those where the applicant has agreed to all conditions of approval shown in the staff reports. Without objection, the staff recommendation for these cases will be approved as a group by unanimous consent of the Board at the beginning of the meeting. When announced by the Chairman, any member of the Board or of the public may ask that one of these cases be removed for full discussion.

1. **CASE BAR2012-0109**
Request for alterations at **806 Duke St**, zoned RM Residential
APPLICANT: Nika & Nicolas Dufour by Jon Han
BOARD ACTION: Approved as amended, on the Consent Calendar, 5-0.
2. **CASE BAR2012-0151**
Request for new construction and alterations at **917 Duke St**, zoned CL Commercial

APPLICANT: Michelle Roeser & Jim Vavricek by Patrick Camus
BOARD ACTION: **Approved as amended, on the Consent Calendar, 5-0.**

On a motion by Mr. von Senden, seconded by Mr. Smeallie, the Consent Calendar was approved, 5-0.

III. DISCUSSION ITEMS

3. **CASE BAR2012-0150**

Request for alterations at **225 N Pitt St**, zoned RM Residential

APPLICANT: Patrick & Lynnette Camus

BOARD ACTION: **Approved as submitted, 5-0.**

SPEAKERS

Phil Mattis removed the item from the Consent Calendar and inquired about the visibility. He advised the Board to preserve more.

Patrick Camus, applicant, spoke in support of the application and noted that the project replaced an existing brick planter and was minimally visible.

BOARD DISCUSSION

On a motion by Mr. von Senden, seconded by Mr. Neale, the application was approved as submitted, 5-0.

REASON

The Board found the proposed alteration to be appropriate.

4. **CASE BAR2012-0148**

Request for alterations at **614 S Saint Asaph St**, zoned RM Residential

APPLICANT: Michael Dyke

BOARD ACTION: **Deferral, 5-0.**

SPEAKERS

Michael Dyke, the applicant, spoke in support of the application, agreed with the staff recommendations and responded to questions. He offered to work with the neighbors to find a mutually acceptable solution.

John Hynan, representing Historic Alexandria Foundation, agreed with the staff recommendations.

Lynn Simarski, neighbor at 612 South Saint Asaph Street, requested a deferral to work out a mutually agreeable design that protected their privacy from the proposed deck to nearby windows.

Guy Guthridge, neighbor at 612 South Saint Asaph Street, requested a deferral to work out a mutually agreeable design.

BOARD DISCUSSION

Mr. Smeallie commented that the application was not a typical application and found the drawings to be of poor quality and without context. He recommended scaling down the deck and lowering it, as well as adding a trellis or lattice.

On a motion by Mr. Smeallie, seconded by Mr. Neale, the Board voted to defer the application for further study and to work with the neighbors. The motion passed on a roll call vote, 5-0.

REASON

The Board found the application materials to be unclear and not properly developed. The Board requested that the applicant work with the adjacent neighbors to devise an appropriate design.

5. CASE BAR2012-0149

Request for alterations at **212 S Pitt St**, zoned RM Residential

APPLICANT: Greg & Nancy Woodford by Patrick Camus

BOARD ACTION: **Approved as amended, 5-0.**

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL:

1. Staff recommends **approval** of the Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed alterations with the condition that:
 - a. The muntins on all of the replacement windows be 5/8" wide and not 7/8" wide as proposed by the applicant, and;
2. Staff recommends **denial** of the request for:
 - a. ~~A copper roof on the rear ell, and~~
 - b. The two simulated divided light replacement windows on the north elevation of the original portion of the rear ell.

SPEAKERS

Patrick Camus, representing the applicant, spoke in support of the application and responded to questions.

John Hynan, representing Historic Alexandria Foundation, stated a preference for keeping the slate roof.

BOARD DISCUSSION

Dr. Fitzgerald, Mr. von Senden, Mr. Smeallie and Mr. Neale all stated they found the copper acceptable though they preferred slate.

On a motion by Mr. Neale, seconded by Dr. Fitzgerald, the Board voted to approve the application as amended with Staff recommendations but allowing copper in place of the slate. The motion passed, 5-0.

REASON

The Board found the proposed changes to generally be appropriate and although found slate to be preferred on the roof of the rear ell, also found the proposed copper standing seam roof to be acceptable because slate was not the original roofing material in this location.

6. CASE BAR2012-0152

Request to partially demolish & capsule at **412 S Fairfax St**, zoned RM Residential

APPLICANT: Alice Reid by G. Ray Lewis, Lewis & Associates

BOARD ACTION: **Approved as amended, 5-0.**

The Board combined this item with #7.

7. CASE BAR2012-0153

Request for addition & alterations at **412 S Fairfax St**, zoned RM Residential

APPLICANT: Alice Reid by G. Ray Lewis, Lewis & Associates

BOARD ACTION: **Approved as amended, 5-0.**

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL:

1. That the four-paneled door with four-light glass inset is changed to a painted wood, six panel wood door or a wood six panel door with glass in the top two panels.
2. That the painted wood siding on the new two-story addition match the exposure found on the existing ~~1970s addition~~ western portion of the historic house.
3. That the following archaeology conditions appear in the General Notes of all site plans and on all site plan sheets that involve demolition or ground disturbance (including Basement/Foundation Plans, Demolition, Erosion and Sediment Control, Grading, Landscaping, Utilities, and Sheeting and Shoring) so that on-site contractors are aware of the requirements.
 - a. The applicant/developer shall call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703-838-4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds.
 - b. The applicant/developer shall not allow any metal detection or artifact collection to be conducted on the property, unless authorized by Alexandria Archaeology.

SPEAKERS

Ray Lewis, representing the applicant, spoke in support of the application and responded to questions. He asked that the siding on the new two story portion match the siding on the west portion of the house, as it was visible from the street.

John Hynan, representing Historic Alexandria Foundation, spoke in support of the application

BOARD DISCUSSION

The Board agreed with the applicants amendment for siding exposure.

On a motion by Mr. von Senden, seconded by Mr. Neale, the Board voted to approve the application as amended, 5-0, with a roll call vote.

REASON

The Board found the proposed addition and alterations to be appropriate.

8. **CASE BAR2012-0154**

Request to partially demolish at **225 N Fairfax St**, zoned CD Commercial

APPLICANT: Kathleen McHugh, MPR Associates by Jeremy Fretts, Niles Bolton Associates

BOARD ACTION: **Approved as submitted, 5-0.**

The Board combined this item with #9.

9. **CASE BAR2012-0155**

Request for alterations at **225 N Fairfax St**, zoned CD Commercial

APPLICANT: Kathleen McHugh, MPR Associates by Jeremy Fretts, Niles Bolton Associates

BOARD ACTION: **Approved as submitted, 5-0.**

SPEAKERS

Jeremy Fretts, representing the applicant, spoke in support of the application and responded to questions.

BOARD DISCUSSION

On a motion by Mr. Smeallie, seconded by Mr. von Senden, the Board approved the application as submitted, by a roll call vote, 5-0.

REASON

The Board found the proposed partial demolition and alterations to be appropriate.

10. **CASE BAR2012-0156**

Request to partially demolish & capsule at **402 S Pitt St**, zoned RM Residential

APPLICANT: Restored Properties, LLC by Stephen Kulinski

BOARD ACTION: **Approved as amended, 4-1.**

The Board combined this item with #11.

11. **CASE BAR2012-0157**

Request for addition & alterations at **402 S Pitt St**, zoned RM Residential

APPLICANT: Restored Properties, LLC by Stephen Kulinski

BOARD ACTION: **Approved as amended, 4-1.**

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL:

1. ~~That the existing chimney/flue remain *in situ* and not be demolished.~~
2. The following statements shall appear in the General Notes of all site plans and on all site plan sheets that involve demolition or ground disturbance (including Basement/Foundation Plans, Demolition, Erosion and Sediment Control, Grading, Landscaping, Utilities, and Sheeting and Shoring) so that on-site contractors are aware of the requirements.
 - a. The applicant/developer shall call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703-838-4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds.
 - b. The applicant/developer shall not allow any metal detection or artifact collection to be conducted on the property, unless authorized by Alexandria Archaeology.

SPEAKERS

Stephen Kulinski, representing the applicant, spoke in support of the application and responded to questions. He stated that he wanted to remove the flue.

John Hynan, representing Historic Alexandria Foundation, supported the project but thought that the chimney should not be demolished.

BOARD DISCUSSION

Mr. Smeallie supported the project but thought that the chimney should not be demolished.

Dr. Fitzgerald stated he did not believe this chimney should be saved when the BAR had not required it on other recent cases.

Chairman Hulfish, Mr. Neale and Mr. von Senden also questioned whether the chimney should be saved because of its limited visibility. They distinguished between a wood burning fireplace chimney and a boiler flue.

On a motion by Mr. Neale, seconded by Mr. von Senden, the Board approved the application as amended with Staff recommendations but allowed for the demolition of the existing chimney, on a roll call vote, 4-1, with Mr. Smeallie in opposition.

REASON

The Board found the proposed addition to be appropriate and supported the restoration of the front porch. The majority of the Board did not think it was necessary to retain the chimney/flue.

IV. OTHER BUSINESS

1. Contraband and Freedmen Cemetery National Register nomination
BOARD ACTION: Support nomination to National Register of Historic Places, 5-0.

On a motion by Mr. von Senden, seconded by Mr. Neale, the Board voted unanimously to support the nomination of this resource to the National Register of Historic Places.

V. ADMINISTRATIVE APPROVALS

The following items are shown for information only. Based on the Board's adopted policies, these cases have been approved by Staff since the previous Board meeting.

CASE BAR2012-0161

Request for roof replacement at **219 S Alfred St**, zoned CL Commercial

APPLICANT: Bob Tyrell by Cole Roofing (David Cole)

CASE BAR2012-0162

Request for window replacement at **215 S Fayette St**, zoned RM Residential

APPLICANT: Dwight Timm by Robert Poleman, Old Town Windows & Doors

CASE BAR2012-0163

Request for window replacement at **628 S Royal St**, zoned RM Residential

APPLICANT: Barbara Rapp by Robert Poleman, Old Town Windows & Doors

CASE BAR2012-0164

Request for antenna installation at **312 S Washington St**, zoned CD Commercial

APPLICANT: Sure Site

CASE BAR2012-0165

Request for window replacement at **619 ½ S Pitt St**, zoned RM Residential

APPLICANT: Michael Courts & Ellen Manetti

CASE BAR2012-0167

Request for signage at **711 King St**, zoned KR King Street Retail

APPLICANT: Vu Huynh

CASE BAR2012-0171

Request for alterations at **413 N Washington St**, zoned RM Residential

APPLICANT: The Carlbery Law Firm by All County HVAC

CASE BAR2012-0172

Request for signage at **103 S Saint Asaph St**, zoned KR King Street Retail
APPLICANT: Nu Look Consignment Apparel Inc., DBA Mint Condition by Antonia Henderson

CASE BAR2012-0177

Request to rebuild chimney at **107 Franklin St**, zoned RM Residential
APPLICANT: Jimmie Cook

CASE BAR2012-0178

Request for siding repair/replacement at **108 Commerce St**, zoned CL Commercial
APPLICANT: Christina Forbes

CASE BAR2012-0180

Request for siding replacement at **619 S Royal St**, zoned RM Residential
APPLICANT: John Durr

CASE BAR2012-0181

Request for window replacement at **105 N Washington St**, zoned KR King Street Retail
APPLICANT: Kamil Property Management LLC c/o Casayork Property Management LLC by Teresa Pasiak-MacLeod

VIII. ADJOURNMENT

Chairman Hulfish adjourned the meeting at approximately 8:25pm.

Minutes submitted by,

Catherine K. Miliaras, Historic Preservation Planner
Boards of Architectural Review